

**Parish: Alne**  
Ward: Easingwold

Committee Date: 10th March 2022  
Officer dealing: Mr M Pearson  
Target Date: 10th January 2022  
Extension of Time:

**3**

**21/02710/MRC**

**Variation to condition Two and Three of 21/00446/FUL - Construction of a single storey extension to existing farm and caravan park office (circa 48 sq m) to provide fully accessible entrance lobby, reception and cafe area, disabled parking and cycle shelter.**

**At: Home Farm, Monk Green, Alne**

**For: Mr & Mrs John and Rachel Price and Mrs Ann Whiteley**

**This proposal is presented to Planning Committee at the request of a Member of the Council**

## **1.0 Site, context and proposal**

- 1.1 This application was heard at the 10<sup>th</sup> February 2022 Planning Committee and deferred on the basis that an alternative approach could be adopted to retain the approved roof tile and utilise the metal cladding on the elevations only. On this basis the applicant has provided amended drawings to reflect this approach.
- 1.2 The application site is located at the entrance to Home Farm from Monk Green and The Alders Caravan Park within the Alne Conservation Area. The significance of this part of the designated area relates to the variety of modern of two storey housing that is generally constructed in a variety of brickwork under pitched pantile roofs. This provides an overriding characteristic of traditional materials in views from the public domain. Beyond the boundary of the Alne Conservation Area are a number of modern portal framed agricultural building clad in metal. These do not contribute to the setting of the designated area.
- 1.3 In May 2021 planning permission was granted for a rear extension of the existing building to provide a café and farm shop (ref no.21/00446/FUL). Work started on site on 20 October 2021. This application seeks retrospective approval for a variation to the approved footprint, it extends the length of the building by about 0.3m and to vary the materials condition.
- 1.4 The scheme in addition to enlarging the building alters the position of the openings. No concern has been raised by officers to the enlargement of the building or position of the windows. However, the applicant has been advised that metal standing seam cladding (on the walls and roof) is not appropriate within the Alne Conservation Area. Officers have suggested that the submitted drawings should be amended to refer to the timber cladding and roof tile previously approved (via the discharge of condition application ref no. 21/00446/DCN in January 2022). In addition, this application also proposes brick gables (already erected on site) as an alternative to the approved timber cladding.

## **2.0 Relevant Planning History**

- 2.1 2/94/006/0125B - Construction of a toilet block - Permitted in 1995.
- 2.2 06/01306/FUL - Revised application for the construction of an amenities block- Permitted in 2006.
- 2.3 10/02774/FUL - Change of use of part of existing Caravan Park for the siting of 2 eco pods - Permitted in 2010.
- 2.4 15/02742/FUL - Retrospective application for the addition of a maximum of 4no eco pods, additional WC facility and provision of 16no tented camping spaces - Permitted in 2015.
- 2.5 20/01229/MRC - Variation of conditions attached to planning applications: 2/92/006/0125A (condition 1); 04/01620/FUL (condition 6); to allow for permanent year-round occupation for holiday purposes as amended on 26th June 2020. Approved in 2020.
- 2.6 21/00446/FUL - Construction of a single storey extension to existing farm and caravan park office (circa 48 sq m) to provide fully accessible entrance lobby, reception and cafe area, disabled parking and cycle shelter. Approved 4<sup>th</sup> May 2021.
- 2.7 21/00446/DCN - Discharge of conditions attached to Planning Consent 21/00446/FUL - Construction of a single storey extension to existing farm and caravan park office (circa 48 sq m) to provide fully accessible entrance lobby, reception and cafe area, disabled parking and cycle shelter. Approved 14.1.2022.

## **3.0 Relevant planning policies**

- 3.1 As set out in paragraph 2 of the NPPF planning law requires that applications for planning permission be determined in accordance with the Development Plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The law is set out at Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and Section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

- 3.2 The relevant policies are:

Local Plan Policy S1 - Sustainable development principles

Local Plan Policy S7 – The historic environment

Local Plan Policy E1 – Design

Local Plan Policy E2 – Amenity

Local Plan Policy E5 – Development affecting heritage assets

## **4.0 Consultations**

- 4.1 Alne Parish Council – No objection.

4.2 Neighbour notification - No responses received (expired 13.12.2021).

4.3 Site notice - No responses received (expired 17.12.2021).

## **5.0 Analysis**

5.1 The main issues to consider are the impact of the alterations to the size, design and appearance of extension on the character of the building and the wider conservation area.

5.2 The proposal involves the minor repositioning of openings within the east gable and north (front) elevation and these minor alterations are considered acceptable. The increase in the size of the footprint is also relatively minor and occurs on the south elevation away from public views. These amendments and the use of brick gables (these have been built) are considered appropriate in appearance from a design perspective and raise no concerns in terms of impact on the character of the building or the Alne Conservation Area.

5.3 As noted above the proposal includes a change from the approved timber cladding to provide a red coloured metal cladding on both the north and south elevation. The proposal has now reverted to the approved roof tile. However, officers still consider this overtly contemporary approach would provide an incongruous feature attached to the existing brick farm building and is considered to have a harmful impact of the appearance of this part of the conservation area. The metal cladding would be representative of modern agricultural structures that are not considered to provide the appropriate design cue. The overriding character of this part of the designated area is the use of traditional local brick and clay tiles that provide appropriate variation to the texture and appearance of facades and roof slopes. This established character resulted in the acceptance of timber cladding and roof tiles through the approval of application ref no. 21/00446/FUL and the subsequent approval of the materials through application 21/00446/DCN.

5.4 On this basis, officers consider that the alternative material would cause less than substantial harm (at the lower end of the scale) to the Alne Conservation Area. National Planning Policy Framework requires consideration of public benefit, no public benefit for the alternative metal material has been identified, the identified harm to the heritage asset cannot be outweighed. In accordance with s.72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 the proposal would fail to preserve or enhance the character or appearance of the Alne Conservation Area. Furthermore, the proposal would fail to satisfy the requirements Local Plan Policies S1, S7, E1 and E5.

### Planning Balance

5.5 Whilst the proposal for minor alterations to the approved elevations and size of footprint are considered to be acceptable the scheme cannot be approved as red coloured standing seam metal cladding is not appropriate within the Alne Conservation Area. In accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework this is considered to cause less than substantial harm to the significance of the designated area and no public benefit for the alternative metal material has been identified to outweigh the identified harm to the heritage asset. On this basis the proposal fails to accord with s.72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and

Conservation Areas) Act 1990, Section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework or relevant Local Development Framework policy in terms of design and conservation.

## **6.0 Recommendation**

- 6.1 That subject to any outstanding consultations the application be **REFUSED** for the following reason(s)
1. The use of a red coloured metal standing seam material on the north and south walls would provide an overtly contemporary appearance to this part of the Alne Conservation where a traditional pallet of brick and tile between the facades and roof slopes is a key characteristic. This alternative metal material would cause less than substantial harm to the significance of this part of the Alne Conservation Area and no public benefit for the alternative metal material has been identified to outweigh the identified harm to the heritage asset. On the basis the proposal fails to accord with s.72 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, and fails the requirements of Local Plan Policies S1, S7, E1 and E5.